

NORTH CAROLINA APPRAISAL BOARD

Meeting Minutes Hilton Garden Inn Charlotte Airport

April 9, 2024

Board Members Present

Mike Warren, Chair
Darius Chase
Marcella Coley
Jack C. (Cal) Morgan, III
Viviree Scotton
H. Clay Taylor, III

Staff Present

Donald T. Rodgers, Executive Director
Brandy M. March, Deputy Director
Sondra C. Panico, Legal Counsel
Jeffrey H. Davison, Investigator
Randall L. Echols, Investigator
Frank Fleming, Investigator
H. Eugene Jordan, Investigator
Mindy Sealy, Office Manager

CALL TO ORDER

Chair Warren called the meeting to order at 9:04 a.m.

Mr. Chase read the Board's Mission Statement.

Chair Warren read the Conflict-of-Interest reminder. No Board Member indicated any conflict of interest.

APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Mr. Taylor moved, second by Mr. Chase, that the Board approve the agenda as amended, with the Chair being able to take the items in any order. Motion carried.

MINUTES
April 9, 2024
Page 2

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Ms. Scotton moved, second by Mr. Chase, to approve the March Minutes (**Exhibit 1**), as presented. Motion carried.

FINANCE

The Board reviewed the financial report (**Exhibit 2**) through March 2024.

Public Rule-Making Hearing (Exhibit 3)

Ms. Panico summarized the proposed rule changes. As of April 9, 2024, the Board did not receive any written comments on the rules. The public comment period ends on May 14, 2024.

LEGAL

Probable Cause (Exhibit 4)

Mr. Morgan moved, second by Ms. Scotton, that the Board accept staff recommendations on all probable cause summaries with the exception of case numbers 2023-0023, 2023-0033, 2024-0005, and 2024-0006. Motion carried.

2023-0023 Ms. Coley moved, second by Mr. Chase, that the Board dismiss this case with a warning to correctly complete research and analysis of all available data and thoroughly proofread reports for inconsistent statements and inaccurate information, conditioned upon completion of the 15-Hour USPAP, a course in appraiser liability and report writing. Motion carried.

2023-0033 Ms. Coley moved, second by Mr. Morgan, that the Board dismiss this case with a warning to proofread for correct detail, provide adequate explanation as to how the selection of comparable properties supports the highest and best use conclusion, and comment on the reliability of the sales comparison approach value conclusion when high adjustments are required. Motion carried.

2023-0039 Dismiss this case conditioned upon completion of a course in appraising in changing markets.

2023-0040 Move this case to a hearing.

2023-0046 Dismiss this case conditioned upon completion of a course in appraiser liability.

MINUTES
April 9, 2024
Page 3

- 2023-0057** Dismiss this case with a warning to carefully proofread reports, conditioned upon completion of a course in highest and best use and appraiser liability.
- 2023-0062** Dismiss this case with a warning to provide a better description of the subject property and describe all the features that the property offers.
- 2023-0066** Dismiss this case conditioned upon completion of a 7-hour sales comparison course and Fannie Mae Guidelines.
- 2023-0072** Move this case to a hearing.
- 2023-0081** Dismiss this case with a warning to ensure the condition of the comparable sales are reported accurately and market supported adjustments are applied when required.
- 2023-0082** Dismiss this case with a warning to ensure the condition of the comparable sales are reported accurately and market supported adjustments are applied when required.
- 2023-0108** Move this case to a hearing.
- 2024-0005** Ms. Coley moved, second by Mr. Morgan, that the Board dismiss this case with a warning to proofread for correct detail, provide adequate explanation as to how the selection of comparable properties supports the highest and best use conclusion, and comment on the reliability of the sales comparison approach value conclusion when high adjustments are required. Motion carried.
- 2024-0006** Ms. Coley moved, second by Mr. Morgan, that the Board dismiss this case with a warning to proofread for correct detail, provide adequate explanation as to how the selection of comparable properties supports the highest and best use conclusion, and comment on the reliability of the sales comparison approach value conclusion when high adjustments are required. Motion carried.

Investigation Request (Exhibit 5)

Mr. Chase moved, second by Ms. Coley, that the Board open a case against the Supervisor, Trainee 1, and Trainee 2. Motion carried.

The Board reviewed the Pending Hearing Report (**Exhibit 6**) and the Disciplinary Actions Year-to-Date (**Exhibit 7**).

MINUTES
April 9, 2024
Page 4

LICENSING AND EDUCATION

The Board reviewed the list of candidates who have been recently registered or certified **(Exhibit 8)**.

The Board reviewed the list of AMCs that have recently been registered **(Exhibit 9)**.

The Board reviewed the Examination Report **(Exhibit 10)** through March 2024.

PUBLIC FORUM (Exhibit 11)

There were no requests to speak at the Public Forum.

OTHER

The Board reviewed the Appraisal Foundation's reports. **(Exhibit 12)**

The Board reviewed the ASC's Compliance Review Findings **(Exhibit 13)**

Mr. Taylor moved, second by Mr. Chase, that the Board move the October virtual Board meeting from October 22, 2024, to October 24, 2024. Motion carried.

Staff Report

Mr. Rodgers attended the Spring meeting of the NC Farm Managers and Rural Appraisers on March 7, 2024. He discussed current statistics on the number of appraisers, the volume and source of complaints and the proposed rules which consists primarily of the addition of the Valuation Bias and Fair Housing Laws and Regulations to the continuing education requirement.

Mr. Rodgers attended a meeting of the NC Chapter of the Appraisal Institute via a Zoom on March 26, 2024, and discussed many of the same topics as well as the status of the PAREA rules that go into effect December 31, 2025.

The Spring AARO Conference will be May 3-5, 2024, in Nashville, TN. There will be additional training for regulators on the morning of May 3, 2024.

Board Members are reminded that their SEI forms are due in by April 15, 2024. If you want to know if yours has been received, you can reach out to Mr. Rodgers or Ms. Sealy.

There will be a Q&A session conducted by Ms. March and Mr. Rodgers this afternoon at 1:30 pm to answer questions about various topics concerning the Appraisal Board, numbers of appraisers, upgrade and renewal requirements, exam statistics, frequent complaint topics, exam and issues involving supervisors and trainees.

MINUTES
April 9, 2024
Page 5

The next Board meeting will be June 4, 2024, at the Board office in Raleigh.

Mr. Morgan moved, second by Ms. Scotton, that the Board go into closed session. Motion carried.

Mr. Morgan moved, second by Ms. Scotton, that the Board go back into open session. Motion carried.


Report from closed session announced in open session:

CONSENT ORDERS

2023-0025 & 2023-0109 R. Lee Currin

Mr. Morgan moved, seconded by Ms. Coley, that effective April 10, 2024, R. Lee Currin shall voluntarily surrender his certification as a residential appraiser. No later than April 10, 2024, Respondent shall no longer engage in the business of real estate appraisal or advertise or hold himself out as engaging or conducting real estate appraisal services, including making any corrections or revisions to any appraisal reports, or accepting any new appraisal assignments. Motion carried.

There being no further business to come before the Board, Ms. Coley moved, second by Mr. Taylor, that the meeting be adjourned. Motion carried.



Donald T. Rodgers, Executive Director

This, the 4th day of June, 2024.



Mike Warren, Chair