

NORTH CAROLINA APPRAISAL BOARD

Minutes Via Video Conference

September 25, 2024

Board Members Present

Mike Warren, Chair
Claire M. Aufrance, Vice-Chair
Sarah J. Burnham
Lynn Carmichael
Darius R. Chase
Marcella D. Coley
Jack C. (Cal) Morgan, III
Viviree Scotton
H. Clay Taylor, III

Staff Present

Donald T. Rodgers, Executive Director
Brandy M. March, Deputy Director
Sondra C. Panico, Legal Counsel
Jeffrey H. Davison, Investigator
Randall L. Echols, Investigator
H. Eugene Jordan, Investigator
Mindy Sealy, Office Manager

Mr. Morgan read the Board's Mission Statement.

CALL TO ORDER

Chair Warren called the meeting to order at 9:01 a.m.

Chair Warren read the Conflict of Interest reminder. No Board Member indicated any conflict of interest.

APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Mr. Taylor moved, second by Mr. Chase, that the Board approve the agenda as amended, with the Chair being able to take the items in any order. Motion carried.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Ms. Aufrance moved, second by Ms. Carmichael, to approve the August Minutes (**Exhibit 1**), as presented. Motion carried.

FINANCE

The Board reviewed the financial reports (**Exhibit 2**) through August 2024.

Ms. Coley moved, second by Ms. Carmichael, that the Board accept the proposed revisions to the Accounting Manual (**Exhibit 3**). Motion carried.

LEGAL

Probable Cause (Exhibit 4)

Ms. Carmichael moved, second by Ms. Coley, that the Board accept staff recommendations on all probable cause summaries with the exception of case numbers 2023-0094 and 2023-0131. Motion carried.

2023-0094 Ms. Coley moved, second by Mr. Chase, that the Board dismiss this case conditioned upon completion of a course in supporting adjustments prior to any late renewal or reinstatement application. Motion carried.

2023-0103 Dismiss this case with a warning to ensure proper analysis is performed and recognized techniques are utilized when appraising properties with an attached dwelling unit, conditioned upon completion of a course in Fannie Mae guidelines and complex appraisals or ADUs.

2023-0104 Dismiss this case.

2023-0105 Dismiss this case with a warning to ensure comparable sales presented in reports offer accurate quality and condition ratings, conditioned upon completion of a course in GSE guidelines.

2023-0114 Dismiss this case with a warning to remember role of the appraiser is to determine the proper scope of work for each assignment and not overlook assignment conditions that require adequate explanation, conditioned upon completion of a course in GSE guidelines and supporting adjustments.

2023-0116 Dismiss this case with a warning advising that altering the scope of work does not override specific assignment conditions and to provide a summary of the results of analyzing the subject sales, other transfers, agreements or sale, options, and listings, conditioned upon completion of a course in appraiser liability.

MINUTES
September 25, 2024
Page 3

- 2023-0119** Dismiss this case.
- 2023-0131** Ms. Coley moved, second by Mr. Chase, that the Board dismiss this case conditioned upon completion of a course in the sales comparison approach and appraising manufactured homes. Motion carried.
- 2024-0046** Dismiss this case with a warning to become familiar with Board regulations and rules to ensure future compliance regarding reporting requirements and/or maintenance of their active North Carolina appraisal license.

The Board reviewed the Pending Hearing Report (**Exhibit 5**) and the Disciplinary Actions Year-to-Date (**Exhibit 6**).

LICENSING AND EDUCATION

The Board reviewed the list of candidates who have been recently registered or certified (**Exhibit 7**).

The Board reviewed the list of AMCs that have recently been registered (**Exhibit 8**).

The Board reviewed the Examination Report (**Exhibit 9**) through August 2024.

PUBLIC FORUM (Exhibit 10)

There were no requests to speak at the Public Forum.

OTHER

The Board reviewed the Appraisal Foundation's reports. (**Exhibit 11**)

Committee Report

The Finance Committee, which consisted of Ms. Burnham, Mr. Chase, Mr. Morgan, and Mr. Warren met with the auditor on September 9, 2024, to review the draft financial statements. The auditor will present the financial statements at the October Board meeting.

Staff Report

Ms. March and Mr. Rodgers hosted a trainee town hall August 13, 2024.

Ms. March attended the IAAO Conference in Denver, CO, August 19-22, 2024.

Mr. Rodgers spoke to the Winston-Salem Association of Realtors, via Zoom, on August 28, 2024. They were interested in emerging appraisal issues, recent rule changes, and types and

MINUTES
September 25, 2024
Page 4

sources of complaints. There were also questions about the potential effect of the NAR settlement on appraisals.

Mr. Rodgers has been asked to speak at the NCPAC Conference, via Zoom, on October 8, 2024.

The Fall AARO Conference will be October 28-30, 2024, in Boston, MA. Travel dates will be Sunday, October 27th through Thursday October 31st. If you know you will not be able to attend, please let Ms. Sealy know as soon as possible so that we can return the rooms.

The next Board meeting will be virtual on Thursday, October 24, 2024. Our auditors from Bernard Robinson, LLC will review our annual audit at that meeting.

The next in person meeting will be Tuesday, December 10, 2024. We will be voting on the 2025 Board calendar. Please let us know of any dates we need to try and work around for the proposed 2025 calendar. Following the meeting, Ms. Panico will be having the Board Member training that had been planned for last week.

Mr. Taylor moved, second by Ms. Carmichael, that the Board go into closed session. Motion carried.

Mr. Taylor moved, second by Ms. Aufrance, that the Board go back into open session. Motion carried.

Report from closed session announced in open session:

Consent Orders

2023-0017 Bobby Hensley

Ms. Carmichael moved, seconded by Ms. Coley, that effective September 25, 2024, Bobby Hensley voluntarily surrendered his certification as a residential appraiser. Effective September 25, 2024, Respondent shall not accept any new appraisal assignments, transmit any appraisal report for any prior engagements, perform any related appraisal services, or hold himself out as a certified or licensed appraiser in this state. It should be noted that these conditions were already in effect since Respondent did not renew his certification effective July 1, 2024. Motion carried.

2023-0040

2023-0107

2023-0108 Robert Mann

Ms. Carmichael moved, seconded by Ms. Coley, that effective November 1, 2024, Robert Mann's certification as a residential appraiser is suspended for a period of six months, of which the first month shall be an active suspension until December 1, 2024, and the remaining five months shall be an inactive suspension until May 1, 2025. No later than February 5, 2025, Respondent shall complete the following coursework: the 30-hour residential sales comparison and income approach qualifying education course and The Appraisal Foundation's corrective education courses entitled,


MINUTES
September 25, 2024
Page 5

“Ethics, Competency, and Negligence” and “Report Certifications: What Am I Signing and Why.” No later than February 5, 2025, Respondent shall provide certificates of completion for all courses to the Board office. The hours for the above coursework shall not be used for Respondent’s continuing education credit hours and requirements. If Respondent fails to successfully complete the courses above and provide certificates of completion to the Board office by February 5, 2025, the inactive suspension will be vacated, and an active suspension shall be activated in its place on February 6, 2025. The active suspension shall continue until Respondent provides proof of completion of the above courses to the Board office, at which time it will convert back to an inactive suspension. Motion carried.

2023-0049 Matthew Melvin


Ms. Coley moved, seconded by Ms. Carmichael, that effective September 25, 2024, Matthew Melvin’s certification as a residential appraiser is reprimanded. No later than March 18, 2025, Respondent shall complete two continuing education courses: one continuing education course in land appraisals, and one seven hour continuing education course in nonlending appraisals. No later than March 18, 2025, Respondent shall provide certificates of completion for all courses to the Board office. The hours for the above coursework shall not be used for Respondent’s continuing education credit hours and requirements. If Respondent fails to successfully complete the courses above and provide certificates of completion to the Board office by March 18, 2025, the reprimand will be vacated, and an active suspension shall be activated in its place on March 19, 2025. The active suspension shall continue until Respondent provides proof of completion of the above courses to the Board office. Motion carried.

There being no further business to come before the Board, Ms. Carmichael moved, second by Ms. Coley, that the meeting be adjourned. Motion carried.



Donald T. Rodgers, Executive Director

This, the 24th day of October 2024.



Mike Warren, Chair