

# **NORTH CAROLINA APPRAISAL BOARD**

## **Meeting Minutes Raleigh**

**June 24, 2025**

### **Board Members Present**

Mike Warren, Chair  
Claire M. Aufrance, Vice-Chair  
Sarah J. Burnham  
Lynn Carmichael  
Darius R. Chase  
Marcella D. Coley  
H. Clay Taylor, III

### **Staff Present**

Donald T. Rodgers, Executive Director  
Brandy M. March, Deputy Director  
Sondra C. Panico, Legal Counsel  
Jeffrey H. Davison, Investigator  
Randall L. Echols, Investigator  
Frank Fleming, Investigator  
Mindy Sealy, Office Manager

### **CALL TO ORDER**

Chair Warren called the meeting to order at 9:02 a.m.

Ms. Coley read the Board's Mission Statement.

Chair Warren read the Conflict-of-Interest reminder. No Board Member indicated any conflict of interest.

### **WELCOME NEW STAFF MEMBER**

Sarah Whitenack was introduced as the Board's new Licensing Specialist.

### **APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

Mr. Taylor moved, second by Ms. Burnham, that the Board approve the agenda, with the Chair being able to take the items in any order. Motion carried.

**MINUTES**  
**June 24, 2025**  
**Page 2**

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

Ms. Aufrance moved, second by Mr. Chase, to approve the April Minutes **(Exhibit 1)**, as presented. Motion carried.

**FINANCE**

The Board reviewed the financial report through May 2025 **(Exhibit 2)**.

The Board discussed the proposed budget for 2025-2026. Ms. Coley moved, second by Ms. Carmichael, that the Board adopt the proposed budget, including staff salaries. Motion carried.

Ms. Burnham moved, second by Ms. Aufrance, that the Board approve excess lodging for 2025-2026. Motion carried.

Ms. Burnham moved, second by Mr. Taylor, that the Board authorizes the Executive Director and the Office Manager to open and manage bank accounts on behalf of the Board. Bank accounts should not exceed the FDIC insured limit by more than 10%. Motion carried.

**LEGAL**

**Probable Cause (Exhibit 3)**

Ms. Carmichael moved, second by Ms. Aufrance, that the Board accept staff recommendations on all probable cause summaries with the exception of case numbers 2024-0029, 2024-0053, 2024-0060, 2024-0068, and AMC case 2025-0002. Motion carried.

- 2024-0029** Ms. Coley moved, second by Mr. Chase, that the Board dismiss this case with a warning to adjust for site size differences when warranted, conditioned upon completion of a course in appraising manufactured housing, rural properties, and the Appraisal Foundation's corrective education course entitled, "Sales Comparison Approach Reconciliation." Motion carried.
- 2024-0035** Dismiss this case.
- 2024-0047** Move this case to a hearing.
- 2024-0052** Dismiss this case with a warning to proofread reports prior to transmission.
- 2024-0053** Ms. Coley moved, second by Ms. Carmichael, that the Board dismiss this case with a warning to ensure reports adhere to GSE guidelines when completing assignments for mortgage lending purposes, conditioned upon completion of a course in making and supporting adjustments. Motion carried.
- 2024-0055** Move this case to a hearing.

**MINUTES**  
**June 24, 2025**  
**Page 3**

- 2024-0057** Dismiss this case.
- 2024-0059** Dismiss this case with a warning to explain and/or apply proper adjustments when market conditions indicate they are required.
- 2024-0060** Mr. Taylor moved, second by Ms. Aufrance, that the Board table the discussion of this case to closed session. Motion carried.
- 2024-0061** Dismiss this case with a warning to accurately identify comparative features and adequately explain why adjustments were or were not made, conditioned upon completion of a course in identifying and supporting adjustments.
- 2024-0064** Dismiss this case conditioned upon completion of an income approach course, GSE guidelines or sales comparison approach.
- 2024-0066** Dismiss this case conditioned upon completion of a sales comparison course.
- 2024-0067** Dismiss this case with a warning to proofread reports to ensure accuracy, verify materials of any unfinished items, and report condition of comparable sales in accordance with UAD guidelines.
- 2024-0068** Ms. Burnham moved, second by Mr. Taylor, that the Board dismiss this case with a warning to identify, analyze, and adequately explain any effect on value of a property based on the physical, environmental, and/or legal characteristics of a site, conditioned upon completion of a course in rural residential properties. Motion carried.
- 2025-0007** Dismiss this case with a warning to correctly report property characteristics and provide adequate explanation for analyses, conditioned upon completion of a course in rural properties.

**AMC**

- 2025-0002** Ms. Burnham moved, second by Ms. Carmichael, that the Board dismiss this case with a warning to ensure payment is made to the correct address provided by North Carolina paneled appraisers within 30 days. Motion carried.

The Board reviewed the Pending Hearing Report (**Exhibit 4**) and the Disciplinary Actions Year-to-Date (**Exhibit 5**).

**LICENSING AND EDUCATION**

The Board reviewed the list of candidates who have been recently registered or certified (**Exhibit 6**).

**MINUTES**  
**June 24, 2025**  
**Page 4**

The Board reviewed the list of AMCs that have recently been registered (**Exhibit 7**).

The Board reviewed the Examination Report through May 2025 (**Exhibit 8**).

**PUBLIC FORUM (Exhibit 9)**

There were no requests to speak at the Public Forum.

**OTHER**

Mr. Taylor moved, second by Ms. Coley, that the Board accept the revisions to the Operations Manual (**Exhibit 10**), as presented. Motion carried.

The Board reviewed The Appraisal Foundation's reports (**Exhibit 11**).

**Committee Report**

The predetermination committee met on June 9, 2025. The committee members in attendance were Lynn Carmichael, Marcella Coley, and H. Clay Taylor. Brandy March was the staff member present and Sondra Panico served as legal advisor to the committee. The committee reviewed two items. The committee determined the Board did not have jurisdiction in both matters and voted to close the case and not investigate.

The Finance Committee met on June 17, 2025, to discuss the 2025-2026 proposed budget.

**Staff Report**

Mr. Rodgers spoke to the joint NCPAC/SCPAC conference in Myrtle Beach, South Carolina on Thursday, May 8, 2025. He and Laura Smith, administrator of the South Carolina Board, gave updates on appraiser and complaint statistics and the new Fair Housing and Appraisal Bias courses that will be required beginning this cycle.

Ms. Sealy and Ms. March are continuing to work on a redesign of the website. They have made significant progress, and we will likely engage a committee of Board members, recommended by the Chair, to review progress and make suggestions. If any Board member has any specific items you would like to see available on the website, please let Ms. Sealy or Ms. March know.

Last week, Dennis Badger, who has been an investigator and instructor for many years and is the current President of AARO, provide two days of training for the enforcement staff. Ms. March and the investigators attended these sessions and Mr. Rodgers and Ms. Panico contributed on one of the days as well. This session was possible due to the grant funding of the Appraisal Subcommittee.

Senate Bill 690 would modify the requirements in North Carolina for individuals seeking to become certified residential appraisers utilizing PAREA. It is scheduled to be heard in a House

**MINUTES**  
**June 24, 2025**  
**Page 5**

committee on June 24, 2025. There is a proposed committee substitute that would require individuals seeking certification through PAREA to submit 15 reports to the Board of which five would be reviewed. This will sunset at the end of 2030. S690 would go into effect January 1, 2026, the same time as the delayed rules, and the Board would commence the process of changing the rules to align with the new statute once the bill passes. Senate Bill 451 requires that many licensing boards reduce their continuing education requirements by one half. It does not appear this bill will be advancing this session.

The Fall AARO Conference will be October 6-8, 2025, in Atlanta, Georgia. Please let Ms. Sealy know as soon as possible whether or not you will be attending.

The Appraisal Subcommittee policy managers will be in the Board office October 21-23, 2025, to do the Board compliance review. The Board's policy manager is currently Maria Brown, and she indicated that Kelly Luteijn will be assisting.

As a reminder, license renewals are due by June 30, 2025. Licensees that completed their continuing education after May 31, 2025, will be able to renew on or after July 1, 2025.

The next Board meeting will be at the Board office on Tuesday, August 19, 2025.

**Election of Chair and Vice-Chair**

The Board elected Ms. Aufrance as Chair for 2025-2026.

The Board elected Mr. Warren as the Vice-Chair for 2025-2026.

Ms. Burnham moved, second by Ms. Carmichael, that the Board go into closed session pursuant to G.S. 143-318.18(6). Motion carried.

Mr. Taylor moved, second by Ms. Carmichael, that the Board go back into open session. Motion carried.

The Board went into closed session to discuss the following which it reported in open session:

**CONSENT ORDERS**

**2023-0121     Matthew Ray**

Mr. Chase moved, second by Ms. Carmichael, that effective June 25, 2025, Matthew Ray, a certified general appraiser, shall receive an administrative warning. No later than January 5, 2026, Respondent shall complete the following course work: (1) a continuing education course on either supporting adjustments or market analysis, which would count for continuing education credit, and (2) The Appraisal Foundation's corrective education course entitled, "Missing Explanations," which does not count for continuing education credit. No later than January 5, 2026, Respondent shall

**MINUTES**  
**June 24, 2025**  
**Page 6**

provide certificates of completion to the Board office. If Respondent fails to successfully complete the courses above and provide certificates of completion to the Board office by January 5, 2026, Respondent's license shall be actively suspended on January 6, 2026. The active suspension shall continue until Respondent provides proof of completion of the above courses to the Board office. Motion carried.

**2024-0001**  
**2025-0005     Salvatore Mastrangelo**

Ms. Aufrance moved, second by Ms. Carmichael, that effective June 25, 2025, Salvatore Mastrangelo's certification as a residential appraiser is inactively suspended for a period of one year. During the inactive suspension, Respondent shall not supervise any trainees in North Carolina. No later than January 5, 2026, Respondent shall complete the following coursework: one continuing education course on desktop/hybrid appraisals; and two Appraisal Foundation Corrective Education courses entitled: "Ethics, Competency, Negligence," and "Report Certifications: What Am I Signing and Why?" No later than January 5, 2026, Respondent shall provide certificates of completion for all courses to the Board office. The hours for the above coursework shall not be used for Respondent's continuing education credit hours and requirements. If Respondent fails to successfully complete the courses above and provide certificates of completion to the Board office by January 5, 2026, an active suspension shall be activated on January 6, 2026. The active suspension shall continue until Respondent provides proof of completion of the above courses to the Board office. Respondent does not plan to complete any appraisals in North Carolina during the inactive suspension of his license. Respondent shall submit in writing every three months to the Board office confirming that he has not completed or provided significant assistance in any appraisals on real property located in North Carolina during the previous three-month period. Any failure to submit the above documentation to the Board office shall result in the inactive suspension becoming an active suspension of Respondent's license until the required documentation is submitted. If Respondent completes any appraisals or provides significant assistance in an appraisal, during any three-month period, he shall submit a complete log of his appraisals to the Board office for the appraisals completed on real property located in North Carolina during that three-month period. These appraisal logs shall be reviewed by Board staff and no less than two appraisals with supporting workfiles listed in each log submission shall be reviewed by Board staff. Respondent shall cooperate with any requests made by Board staff to review his appraisal reports and workfiles. Any failure to cooperate with Board staff will result in the inactive suspension becoming an active suspension for the remainder of the inactive suspension period. In reviewing any appraisal report, if there are violations of the Board statutes, rules, or USPAP uncovered, further disciplinary action may be taken by the Board, after notice and an opportunity for a hearing has been provided. Motion carried.

**PC Summary**

**2024-0060**     Ms. Aufrance moved, second by Mr. Taylor, that the Board dismiss this case. Motion carried.

**MINUTES**  
**June 24, 2025**  
**Page 7**

There being no further business to come before the Board, Mr. Taylor moved, second by Ms. Aufrance, that the meeting be adjourned. Motion carried.



Donald T. Rodgers, Executive Director

This, the 19 day of August, 2025.



Claire M. Aufrance, Chair